

Problem of the Week / 2010-5

김리현 (06학번)

Let y be a rational number s.t. $\cos \pi y, \sin \pi y, 1$ are linearly dependent over \mathbb{Q} , that is,

$$\exists p, q, r \in \mathbb{Q} \quad \text{s.t.} \quad p \cos \pi y + q \sin \pi y + r = 0.$$

$$\Rightarrow p \cos \pi y + q \sqrt{1 - \cos^2 \pi y} + r = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow (p \cos \pi y + r)^2 = q^2 (1 - \cos^2 \pi y)$$

$$\Rightarrow \begin{cases} (p^2 + q^2) \cos^2 \pi y + 2pr \cos \pi y + (r^2 - q^2) = 0 \\ (p^2 + q^2) \sin^2 \pi y + 2qr \sin \pi y + (r^2 - p^2) = 0 \end{cases}$$

Define $\eta = e^{\pi i y} = \cos \pi y + i \sin \pi y$.

If $\frac{y}{2} = \frac{n}{m}$ where $\gcd(m, n) = 1$, then η is an m th primitive root of unity, i.e., $\eta^m = 1$, and $\eta^k \neq 1 \quad \forall k \in \{1, 2, \dots, m-1\}$.

Note that $\cos \pi y = \frac{1}{2} \left(\eta + \frac{1}{\eta} \right)$.

$$\Rightarrow (p^2 + q^2) \frac{1}{4} \left(\eta^2 + \frac{1}{\eta^2} + 2 \right) + 2pr \cdot \frac{1}{2} \left(\eta + \frac{1}{\eta} \right) + (r^2 - q^2) = 0$$

$$\Rightarrow \left(\frac{p^2 + q^2}{4} \right) \eta^2 + (pr) \eta + \left(\frac{p^2}{2} - \frac{q^2}{2} + r^2 \right) + (pr) \frac{1}{\eta} + \frac{p^2 + q^2}{4} \frac{1}{\eta^2} = 0$$

$$\text{Let } f(x) = \frac{p^2 + q^2}{4} x^4 + pr x^3 + \left(\frac{p^2}{2} - \frac{q^2}{2} + r^2 \right) x^2 + pr x + \frac{p^2 + q^2}{4}.$$

Then $f \in \mathbb{Q}[x]$ and $\deg f = 4$, $f(\eta) = 0$.

Since $f(\eta) = 0$ and $\eta^n = 1$, we have $f(x) \mid x^n - 1$.

And, $f(x) \nmid x^k - 1 \quad \forall k \in \{1, 2, \dots, n-1\}$. ($\because \eta^k \neq 1 \quad \forall k \in \{1, 2, \dots, n-1\}$).

Let $\Phi_d(x)$ be the d th cyclotomic polynomial.

$$\text{(i.e., } \Phi_d(x) = \prod_{\substack{1 \leq k \leq d \\ (k,d)=1}} (x - e^{\frac{2\pi i k}{d}}) \text{)}$$

Then ① $\Phi_d \in \mathbb{Q}[x] \quad \forall d$, ② Φ_d is irreducible over \mathbb{Q} ,

$$\text{③ } x^n - 1 = \prod_{d \mid n} \Phi_d(x) \quad \forall n.$$

Claim $\Phi_m(x) \mid f(x)$.

(\because If not, then every irreducible factor of $f(x)$ is the form of $\Phi_d(x)$, d is a proper divisor of n .
But, $\Phi_d(x) \mid x^d - 1$ where $d < n$.)

So, $\deg \Phi_m(x) \leq \deg f(x) = 4$.

$$\Rightarrow \underline{\varphi(m) \leq 4}.$$

$$\text{① } \varphi(m) = 1 \Rightarrow m = 1, 2 \text{ and } y = 1, 2 \left(\because \frac{y}{2} = \frac{n}{m} \text{ and } e^{\pi i y} \text{ is an } m\text{th primitive root of } 1 \right)$$

$$\text{② } \varphi(m) = 2 \Rightarrow m = 3, 4, 6 \text{ and } y = \frac{2}{3}, \frac{4}{3}, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{3}{2}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{5}{3}$$

$$\text{③ } \varphi(m) = 3 \Rightarrow \text{no such } m$$

$$\text{④ } \varphi(m) = 4 \Rightarrow m = 5, 8, 10, 12 \text{ and}$$

$$y = \frac{2}{5}, \frac{4}{5}, \frac{6}{5}, \frac{8}{5}, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{3}{4}, \frac{5}{4}, \frac{7}{4}, \frac{1}{5}, \frac{3}{5}, \frac{7}{5}, \frac{9}{5}, \frac{1}{6}, \frac{5}{6}, \frac{7}{6}, \frac{11}{6}.$$

But, $\sin \frac{\pi}{5} = \sqrt{\frac{5-\sqrt{5}}{8}}$ and $\nexists p, q, r \in \mathbb{Q}$ s.t.

$$-(p^2+q^2) \sin^2 \frac{\pi}{5} + 2qr \sin \frac{\pi}{5} + r^2 - p^2 = 0.$$

Similar for $y = \frac{2}{5}, \frac{3}{5}, \dots, \frac{9}{5}$.

You may verify that $\cos \pi y, \sin \pi y, 1$ are linearly indep.
for other cases.

Hence, $y \in \{1, 2, \frac{1}{2}, \frac{3}{2}, \frac{1}{3}, \frac{2}{3}, \frac{4}{3}, \frac{5}{3}, \frac{1}{4}, \frac{3}{4}, \frac{5}{4}, \frac{7}{4}, \frac{1}{6}, \frac{5}{6}, \frac{7}{6}, \frac{11}{6}\}$.

Simply, $y \in \{\frac{k}{12} \mid 1 \leq k \leq 24, k \text{ and } 12 \text{ are not coprime}\}$.

Remark:

Observe that if y is a solution,
then $y+2$ is a solution as well.

So the set of solutions should be:

$\{k/12 : \gcd(k, 12) \text{ is not } 1, k: \text{integer}\}$