

1 Introduction

About this lecture

- Proof strategies
- Proofs involving negations and conditionals.
- Proofs involving quantifiers
- Proofs involving conjunctions and biconditionals
- Proofs involving disjunctions
- Existence and uniqueness proof
- More examples of proofs..
- Course homepages: <http://mathsci.kaist.ac.kr/~schoi/logic.html> and the moodle page <http://moodle.kaist.ac.kr>
- Grading and so on in the moodle. Ask questions in moodle.

Some helpful references

- Sets, Logic and Categories, Peter J. Cameron, Springer. Read Chapters 3,4,5.
- A mathematical introduction to logic, H. Enderton, Academic Press.
- <http://plato.stanford.edu/contents.html> has much resource.
- Introduction to set theory, Hrbacek and Jech, CRC Press.
- Thinking about Mathematics: The Philosophy of Mathematics, S. Shapiro, Oxford. 2000.

Some helpful references

- http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Truth_table,
- <http://logik.phl.univie.ac.at/~chris/gateway/formular-uk-zentral.html>, complete (i.e. has all the steps)
- <http://svn.oriontransfer.org/TruthTable/index.rhtml>, has xor, complete.

2 Proofs involving disjunctions

Proofs involving disjunctions

- To use a given of form $P \vee Q$.
- First method is to divide into cases:
- For case 1, assume P and derive something.
- For case 2, assume Q and derive something, preferably same as above.
- This is the same as disjunction elimination $\vee E$ in Nolt.
- Example in the book $A \subset C, B \subset C, \vdash A \cup B \subset C$.
- The second method: Given $\neg P$ or can show P false, then we can assume Q only.

- | | |
|------------|-------|
| Given | Goal |
| $P \vee Q$ | ----- |
| ----- | |
- | | |
|-------------|-------|
| Given | Goal |
| Case 1: P | ----- |
| ----- | |
| Case 2: Q | ----- |
| ----- | |

Example

- Example: $A - (B - C) \subset (A - B) \cup C$.
- $\forall x(x \in A - (B - C) \rightarrow x \in (A - B) \cup C)$.

-
- | | |
|-------|---|
| Given | Goal |
| ----- | $\forall x(x \in A - (B - C) \rightarrow x \in (A - B) \cup C)$. |
- | | |
|---------------------|------------------------|
| Given | Goal |
| x arbitrary | $x \in (A - B) \cup C$ |
| $x \in A - (B - C)$ | |
-

•

Given	Goal
$x \in A \wedge \neg(x \in B \wedge x \notin C)$	$(x \in A \wedge x \notin B) \vee x \in C$

•

Given	Goal
$x \in A$	$(x \in A \wedge x \notin B) \vee x \in C$
$x \notin B \vee x \in C$	

•

Given	Goal
$x \in A$	$(x \in A \wedge x \notin B) \vee x \in C$
<i>Case1</i> : $x \notin B$	
<i>Case2</i> : $x \in C$	

- Case 1 gives $x \in A - B$. Case 2 gives $x \in C$.

To prove a goal of form $P \vee Q$.

- First method: break into cases and prove P and prove Q for each cases.
- Example above $(A - B) - C \subset (A - B) \cup C$.
- Second method: Assume $\neg Q$ and prove P .

•

Given	Goal
-----	$P \vee Q$

- Change to

Given	Goal
-----	P

$\neg Q$	

- Suppose that m and n are integers. If mn is even, then either m is even or n is even.

•

Given	Goal
mn is even	m is even \vee n is even

•

Given	Goal
mn is even	n is even
m is odd	

-

$$mn = 2k, (2j + 1)n = 2k, 2jn + n = 2k, n = 2k - 2jn = 2(k - jn)$$

Thus, n is even.

3 The existence and uniqueness proof

The existence and uniqueness proof.

- $\exists!xP(x) \leftrightarrow \exists x(P(x) \wedge \neg(\exists y(P(y) \wedge y \neq x)))$.
- Using equivalences we obtain $\neg(\exists y(P(y) \wedge y \neq x)) \leftrightarrow \forall y(P(y) \rightarrow y = x)$.
- $\exists!xP(x) \leftrightarrow \exists x(P(x) \wedge \forall y(P(y) \rightarrow y = x))$.
- The following are equivalent
 - $\exists x(P(x) \wedge \forall y(P(y) \rightarrow y = x))$.
 - $\exists x\forall y(P(y) \leftrightarrow y = x)$.
 - $\exists xP(x) \wedge \forall y\forall z((P(y) \wedge P(z)) \rightarrow y = z)$.

Example

- We will prove by proving $1 \rightarrow 2 \rightarrow 3 \rightarrow 1$.
- $1 \rightarrow 2$.

-

Given	Goal
$\exists x(P(x) \wedge \forall y(P(y) \rightarrow y = x))$	$\exists x\forall y(P(y) \leftrightarrow y = x)$

-

Given	Goal
$P(x_0)$	$\exists x\forall y(P(y) \leftrightarrow y = x)$
$\forall y(P(y) \rightarrow y = x_0)$	

-

Given	Goal
$P(x_0)$	$\forall y(P(y) \leftrightarrow y = x)$
$\forall y(P(y) \rightarrow y = x_0)$	
$x = x_0$	

- \rightarrow is clear in the Goal side. \leftarrow is clear also.

Example

- $2 \rightarrow 3$.

•

Given	Goal
$\exists x \forall y (P(y) \leftrightarrow y=x)$	$\exists x P(x) \wedge \forall y \forall z ((P(y) \wedge P(z)) \rightarrow y=z)$

- First goal

Given	Goal
$\forall y (P(y) \rightarrow y = x_0)$	$\exists x P(x)$
$P(x_0)$	

- Second goal

Given	Goal
$\forall y (P(y) \rightarrow y = x_0)$	$\forall y \forall z (P(y) \wedge P(z) \rightarrow y = z)$
$P(x_0)$	

•

Given	Goal
$\forall y (P(y) \rightarrow y = x_0)$	$(P(y) \wedge P(z)) \rightarrow y = z$
$P(x_0)$	
y arbitrary	
z arbitrary	

•

Given	Goal
$\forall y (P(y) \rightarrow y = x_0)$	$y = z$
$P(x_0)$	
$P(y)$	
$P(z)$	

- Then $y = x_0$ and $z = x_0$. Hence the conclusion.

Example

- Finally $3 \rightarrow 1$.

•

Given	Goal
$\exists x P(x) \wedge \forall y \forall z ((P(y) \wedge P(z)) \rightarrow y=z)$	$\exists x (P(x) \wedge \forall y (P(y) \rightarrow y=x))$

•

Given	Goal
$P(x_0)$	$P(x_0) \wedge \forall y (P(y) \rightarrow y=x_0)$
$\forall y \forall z ((P(y) \wedge P(z)) \rightarrow y = z)$	

-

Given	Goal
$P(x_0)$	$y = x_0$
$\forall y \forall z ((P(y) \wedge P(z)) \rightarrow y = z)$	
$P(y)$	

- Since $P(x_0), P(y)$, we have $x_0 = y$. Done.

- To prove a goal of form $\exists! x P(x)$
- Prove $\exists x P(x)$ (existence) and $\forall y \forall z (P(y) \wedge P(z) \rightarrow y = z)$. (uniqueness)
- To use a given of form $\exists! x P(x)$.
- Treat as two assumptions $\exists x P(x)$ (existence) and $\forall y \forall z (P(y) \wedge P(z) \rightarrow y = z)$. (uniqueness)

Example

- A, B, C are sets. $A \cap B \neq \emptyset, A \cap C \neq \emptyset$. A has a unique element. Then prove $B \cap C \neq \emptyset$.

-

Given	Goal
$A \cap B \neq \emptyset$	$B \cap C \neq \emptyset$
$A \cap C \neq \emptyset$	
$\exists! x (x \in A)$	

-

Given	Goal
$\exists x (x \in A \wedge x \in B)$	$\exists x (x \in B \wedge x \in C)$
$\exists x (x \in A \wedge x \in C)$	
$\exists x (x \in A)$	
$\forall y \forall z (y \in A \wedge z \in A \rightarrow y = z)$	

-

Given	Goal
$b \in A \wedge b \in B$	$\exists x (x \in B \wedge x \in C)$
$c \in A \wedge c \in C$	
$a \in A$	
$\forall y \forall z ((y \in A \wedge z \in A) \rightarrow y = z)$	

- $b = a$ and $c = a$. Thus $a \in B \wedge a \in C$.

4 More examples of proofs

- This illustrates the existence proof:
- $\lim_{x \rightarrow 2} x^2 + 2 = 6$.
- Cauchy's definition: $\forall \epsilon > 0 (\exists \delta > 0 (\forall x (|x - 2| < \delta \rightarrow |x^2 + 2 - 6| < \epsilon)))$.

•

Given	Goal
$\epsilon > 0$ arbitrary	$\exists \delta > 0 (\forall x (x - 2 < \delta \rightarrow x^2 + 2 - 6 < \epsilon))$

•

Given	Goal
$\epsilon > 0$ arbitrary	$ x^2 + 2 - 6 < \epsilon$
$\delta = \delta_0$ must find	
$ x - 2 < \delta$	

- Guess work: Find conditions on δ . Assume $|x - 2| < \delta, \delta < 1$. Then we obtain $|x - 2| < 1, 3 < x + 2 < 5, |x + 2| < 5$. Thus $|x^2 - 4| = |x - 2||x + 2| < 5\delta$. Thus, choose $\delta = \min\{1/2, \epsilon/5\}$. Then
- $\epsilon/5 \leq 1/2$ case: $|x - 2| < \epsilon/5 \rightarrow |(x - 2)(x + 2)| < \epsilon$.
- $1/2 \leq \epsilon/5$ case: $|x - 2| < 1/2 \rightarrow |(x - 2)(x + 2)| < 5(1/2) \leq 5\epsilon/5 < \epsilon$.
- Theorem $\lim_{x \rightarrow 2} x^2 + 2 = 6$.
- Proof: Suppose that $\epsilon > 0$. Let $\delta = \min\{1/2, \epsilon/5\}$.
- Then $|x - 2| < 1/2$ and $|x - 2| < \epsilon/5$.
- $|x + 2| < 5$ by above and $|(x - 2)(x + 2)| < \epsilon/5 \cdot 5 < \epsilon$.
- Thus, $|x^2 + 2 - 6| < \epsilon$.
- $\forall \epsilon > 0$, if $\delta = \min\{1/2, \epsilon/5\}$, then $\forall x (|x - 2| < \delta \rightarrow |x^2 + 2 - 6| < \epsilon)$. \square

- $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} \sqrt{x} = \sqrt{c}$, ($x > 0, c > 0$).
- $\forall c > 0 (\forall \epsilon > 0 \exists \delta > 0 (\forall x > 0 (|x - c| < \delta \rightarrow |\sqrt{x} - \sqrt{c}| < \epsilon)))$.

- | | |
|--------------------------|--|
| Given | Goal |
| $\epsilon > 0$ arbitrary | $\exists \delta > 0 (\forall x > 0 (x - c < \delta \rightarrow \sqrt{x} - \sqrt{c} < \epsilon))$ |

- | | |
|---------------------------|------------------------------------|
| Given | Goal |
| $\epsilon > 0$ arbitrary | $ \sqrt{x} - \sqrt{c} < \epsilon$ |
| $\delta = \delta_0$ | |
| $ x - c < \delta, x > 0$ | |

- **Guess work:**

- $|\sqrt{x} - \sqrt{c}| = |x - c| / (\sqrt{x} + \sqrt{c}) \leq |x - c| / \sqrt{c}$.

- Let $\delta = \sqrt{c}\epsilon$.

- Then $|x - c| < \sqrt{c}\epsilon \rightarrow |\sqrt{x} - \sqrt{c}| < \epsilon$.

- | | |
|-----------------------------|------------------------------------|
| Given | Goal |
| $\epsilon > 0$ arbitrary | $ \sqrt{x} - \sqrt{c} < \epsilon$ |
| $\delta = \sqrt{c}\epsilon$ | |
| $ x - c < \delta, x > 0$ | |

- **Theorem:** $\lim_{x \rightarrow c} \sqrt{x} = \sqrt{c}$. Assume $x, c > 0$.

- **Proof:** Let $\epsilon > 0$ be arbitrary. Let $\delta = \sqrt{c}\epsilon$. Then $|x - c| < \sqrt{c}\epsilon$.

- $|\sqrt{x} - \sqrt{c}| = |x - c| / (\sqrt{x} + \sqrt{c}) \leq |x - c| / \sqrt{c} < \epsilon$.

- $\forall x, x > 0, |x - c| < \sqrt{c}\epsilon \rightarrow |\sqrt{x} - \sqrt{c}| < \epsilon$.

- $\forall c > 0 (\forall \epsilon > 0 \exists \delta > 0 (\forall x > 0 (|x - c| < \delta \rightarrow |\sqrt{x} - \sqrt{c}| < \epsilon)))$.